

### **Review of:**

Comment on “Glauert’s optimum rotor disk revisited – a calculus of variations solution and exact integrals for thrust and bending moment coefficients” by Tyagi and Schmitz (2025) – Version 3

### **Author:**

J. Gordon Leishman, Ph.D., D.Sc. (Eng.), F.R.Ae.S.

### **General**

The manuscript has changes considerably. Nevertheless, some of its statements seems to be in tension with accepted knowledge about the general momentum theory of rotors.

### **Specific**

Lines 14 to 20 ( $\lambda \rightarrow \infty$ ):

The asymptotic structure ( $\lambda \rightarrow \infty$ ) of  $c_p(\lambda)$  has been investigated already in 1955 to forth order in inverse TSR [1]. This contradicts author’s statement that “*Any expression predicting nonzero power in this limit is inconsistent with the angular momentum balance on which the model is based*” Author should give detailed reasons for his statement or relevant references.

### **Reference**

[1] G. Schmitz, Theorie und Entwurf von Windrädern optimaler Leistung (Theory and Design of Wind Wheels with optimum Power), pp 379 – 391, Wiss. Z. d. Univ. Rostock, German Democratic Republic (1955)